NIMEQ: MHD Equilibrium Solver for NIMROD E.C.Howell, C.R.Sovinec University of Wisconsin-Madison 50th Annual Meeting of Division of Plasma Physics Dallas, Texas, Nov. 17-Nov. 21,2008

Abstract

• A Grad-Shafranov equilibrium solver is developed within the NIMROD framework to create plasma profiles for realistic geometry. The traditional Grad-Shafranov operator is converted to a pure divergence allowing the use of standard regularity conditions for the quantity ψ/R^2 in simply connected domains. The resulting equation is solved in the weak form using a finite element representation. A Picard scheme is used to advance the nonlinear iteration.

Outline

- Introduction
- Outline of solver
 - Derivation of finite element Grad-Shafranov operator
 - Inhomogeneous boundary conditions
 - Nonlinear iteration
 - Calculation of equilibrium fields
 - NIMROD Implementation
- Verification of solver accuracy
 - Constant lambda cylindrical pinch
 - Circular cross section tokamak
 - SSPX geometry
- Conclusions & future work

INTRODUCTION: The NIMROD code is a computational laboratory designed to study 3D plasmas for fusion based applications [Phys. Plasmas **10** (2003) 1727].

- NIMROD uses a spectral element expansion in 2 dimensions and finite Fourier series in the third.
 - Spectral element expansion provides NIMROD with the flexibility to study plasma in complex geometries.
 - High-order accuracy resolves extreme anisotropy.
 - Fourier expansion in third dimension requires a degree of symmetry.
 - Linear periodic or toroidal geometry
- Nimrod uses an implicit leap frog time advance [JoP: Conf. Ser. 16, 25 (2005)].
 - Allows timesteps that are large relative to normal-mode propagation times.

NIMROD computations use Grad-Shafranov equilibria in many applications.

- The capability to create simple 1D equilibria exists within NIMROD's preprocessor .
- For more complex geometries, an equilibrium is created from an external source and then interpolated to a NIMROD mesh.
 - The process of interpolation introduces numerical errors into the equilibrium.
 - Software designed to reconstruct equilibria from experimental measurements may sacrifice accuracy for speed.
 - The propagation of these errors though the simulation increases as the disparity of spatial and temporal scales in the physics increase.
- NIMROD simulations use equilibria as initial states or as fixed data, where the code just evolves perturbations.

Simulations used to study linear instabilities in SSPX discharges illustrate the practicality of a native equilibrium solver.





- Cylindrical pinch
 - SSPX profiles have been approximated with linear cylindrical pinches.
 - Analytic solutions can be used to generate equilibrium.
 - Simplifications result in loss of geometric effects.
- Realistic mesh representing entire flux conserver
 - Geometric effects from gun and wall are included.
 - Initial conditions can be read from reconstructed equilibria.
 - A native solve can be used to scan profiles in this realistic geometry.

Creating an equilibrium solver within NIMROD allows the full use of spectral element flexibility and accuracy.

- Using the same expansion to create equilibria and run MHD simulations eliminates all interpolation errors.
 - Best possible equilibrium for a particular grid.
- NIMROD users will be able to modify the solver to meet demands of specific applications.
 - Magnetosphere plasma profiles
 - Parameterized tokamaks, RFPs, and spheromaks
 - Refine equilibria from other codes
- Modularity of NIMROD provides most of the computational tools needed for the equilibrium solver.

Outline of solver: The Grad-Shafranov equation describes 2 dimensional axisymmetric plasma equilibria with no flow.

$$\Delta^* \psi = -F(\psi)F'(\psi) - \mu_0 R^2 p'(\psi)$$

$$\hat{\partial}^2 = 1 \hat{\partial} = \hat{\partial}^2$$

$$\Delta^* \equiv \frac{\partial}{\partial R^2} - \frac{1}{R} \frac{\partial}{\partial R} + \frac{\partial}{\partial z^2}$$

- Nonlinear, elliptic, partial differential equation for the flux function $\psi(R,z)$
 - F and p are independent functions of ψ and need to be specified.
 - $F = RB_{\varphi} p = pressure$
- In a linear geometry ($\varphi =>z$), the del star operator reduces to the Laplacian in (x,y).

$$\nabla^{2}\psi = -F(\psi)F'(\psi) - \mu_{0}p'(\psi)$$

The Grad-Shafranov operator can be expressed as a total divergence.

$$\vec{A} \equiv R^{2} \nabla \left(R^{-2} \psi \right) \qquad \Xi = R^{-2} \psi$$
$$\nabla \cdot \vec{A} = \frac{\partial^{2}}{\partial R^{2}} \psi - \frac{1}{R} \frac{\partial}{\partial R} \psi + \frac{\partial^{2}}{\partial z^{2}} \psi = \Delta^{*} \psi$$

• Expanding ψ shows that Ξ is well behaved near R=0 as long as $\psi_0=0$.

$$\psi = \psi_0 + \psi_2 R^2 + \dots$$
$$\Xi = \frac{\psi_0}{R^2} + \psi_2 + \dots$$

• We choose $\psi_0=0$ for the arbitrary constant so that Ξ satisfies standard regularity conditions.

A finite element algebraic equation is formulated for the dependent variable Ξ .

 $\nabla \cdot (R^2 \nabla \Xi) = G(\Xi, R), \quad G(\Xi, R) \equiv -\mu_0 F F' - \mu_0 p' R^2$

$$\int \left(\nabla \cdot (R^2 \nabla \Xi) \right) \alpha_i(R, z) dV = \int G \alpha_i dV$$
 Weak form of Grad-
Shafranov equation

 $\Xi = \sum \Xi_j \alpha_j(R, z) \qquad \text{Expand} \\ \text{finite e}$

Expand dependent variable with finite element basis functions

$$\sum_{j} \int R^{2} \left(\frac{\partial \alpha_{i}}{\partial R} \frac{\partial \alpha_{j}}{\partial R} + \frac{\partial \alpha_{i}}{\partial Z} \frac{\partial \alpha_{j}}{\partial Z} \right) dV \Xi_{j} = -\int G \alpha_{i} dV + surface terms$$

No contribution for Dirchlet boundary conditions on Ξ

A surface integral is performed to calculate ψ along the boundary.

• The change in the flux function along the boundary is given by

$$\Delta \psi = -\int_{x1}^{x2} R(\vec{B} \cdot \hat{n}) dl$$

- Normal magnetic field is prescribed.
- Gaussian quadrature is used to perform surface integral.
- The value Ξ along the border is used as essential conditions on the expansion.
- In toroidal geometry regularity places further constraints on ψ .

$$\lim_{r\to 0} B_z/2 \to \psi_2$$

A modified Picard scheme is used to perform nonlinear iteration.

$$\underline{\Xi}^{n+1} = w \underline{\underline{M}}^{-1} \underline{\underline{G}}^n + (1 - w) \underline{\underline{\Xi}}^n$$

- *w* is a relaxation parameter that provides stabilization to nonlinear iteration.
- Convergence in checked by comparing the residual of the nonlinear solve with the magnitude of

$$\frac{\left\|\Delta^{*}\psi + FF' + \mu_{0}R^{2}P'\right\|}{\left\|\Delta^{*}\psi\right\|} \equiv error$$

- In practice, Picard scheme is adequate.
 - Computation takes 1-2 minutes on laptops and workstations.
- A Newton iteration can be added to accelerate convergence near solution.

The equilibrium $\vec{B}(R,z)$, $\vec{J}(R,z)$, and p(R,z) are calculated from Ξ , $F(\psi)$, and $p(\psi)$.

$$R \vec{B} = R \nabla \phi \times \nabla \psi + F \hat{e}_{\phi}$$
$$\mu_{0} \vec{J} = F' \nabla \psi \times \nabla \phi + \Delta^{*} \psi \nabla \phi$$

• Chain rule is applied to calculate \vec{B} from the known quantity Ξ and then \vec{J}_{pol} is calculated from \vec{B}_{pol} .

- Nimrod uses RB_{φ} and $R^{-1}J_{\varphi}$ in the representation of equilibrium fields.

$$R \vec{B}_{pol} = \hat{e}_{\phi} \times \left(R^{2} \nabla \Xi + 2R \Xi \hat{e}_{r}\right)$$

$$RB_{\phi} = F$$

$$\mu_{0} \vec{J}_{pol} = -\vec{B}_{pol} F'$$

$$R^{-1} J_{\phi} = -FF' / \mu_{0} R^{2} - P'$$

NIMEQ flowchart shows the steps in the nonlinear iteration.



Several basic models for *F* and *p* have been implemented.

- A normalized ring flux Y has been calculated to distinguish between physics in open and closed flux regions.
 - Y=0 on the magnetic axis
 - Y=1 on separatrix and open flux region
- Three models for *F*
 - $F=f_open+f1*(1-Y)+4*f2*Y(Y-1)$
 - $F=f_open+(f_axis-f_open)*(1-3Y^2+2Y^3)$
 - $F=f0+f1\psi$
- Two models for pressure
 - $P = P_0$
 - $P=P_open + (P_axis-P_open)*(1-3Y^2+2Y^3)$

Verification of solver accuracy :Analytic solutions for the magnetic field in a constant lambda cylindrical pinch are used to benchmark solver.

- Magnetic fields are functions radius only.
 - $B_{\varphi} = -B_0 J_1(\lambda R) \quad B_z = B_0 J_0(\lambda R) \quad B_r = 0$
 - Nimrod uses (R,z,φ) coordinates instead of (R,θ,z) coordinates.
 - B_z reverses sign at $\lambda R=2.404$.
- Three different computation grids are used to test different aspects of the solver.
 - Rectangular grid in a toroidal configuration with B specified along the entire boundary.
 - Rectangular grid in a toroidal configuration with periodic boundary conditions in the *z*-direction and the flux specified on the outer boundary.
 - Circular grid with periodicity in the *z*-direction and the flux specified on the outer boundary.

Plots of equilibrium fields generated with a rectangular mesh show agreement with analytic solutions.



R(m)

Contours of B_R for rectangular grids with different boundary conditions display the surface integrator accuracy.



- Values of \vec{B} specified on boundary
- 16x16 elements with 4th order polynomials
- Max $B_R = 1.863 \times 10^{-10}$
- $B_0 = 1.0$



- Periodic boundary conditions in z with ψ specified on outer surface
- 16x16 elements with 4th order polynomials
- Max $B_R = 1.833 \times 10^{-12}$
- $B_0 = 1.0$

Comparison of equilibrium fields on circular grid verifies the solver in non-toroidal systems.



- Fields for $\lambda = 1$ solutions agree with theoretical values.
- Plots of \vec{B}_{pol} show that that B_R is small and depends only on ψ .
- Nonlinear iterations fail to converge for equilibria with $\lambda = 2.5$ (axial field reversal).
 - Additional work is being done to improve convergence.



- Generated equilibrium is used as initial condition for nonlinear simulation.
 - Major Radius =2 Minor radius =1
 - Cubic pressure profile with $\beta \sim 0.3$
 - 18x18 circular grid with 5th order polynomials
- Simulation ran for 7500 τ_A .
- A change in peak pressure of 0.046% is observed.

An equilibrium for SSPX is generated on a grid that represents its flux conserver.

- Quadratic model for F is used with RB_{phi} on the magnetic axis set to 0.17 Tm.
- Cubic model for pressure with $u_0 P$ on axis set to 0.1. $-\beta = 2/3$
- $\tau_A = 1.88 \times 10^{-7} s$
- 20x28 mesh with 4th order polynomial elements
- Equilibrium was designed with no open flux surfaces to aid simulations of nonlinear evolution.



Axisymmetric nonlinear simulations of SSPX equilibrium test the quality of equilibrium.

Initial pressure

Final pressure





- Simulation is run for $\sim 100 t_A$
- Peak pressure changed by $\sim 0.16\%$
- An isotropic number density diffusivity of 100 m²/s is used for numerical stability.

Conclusions & Future Work

- A Grad-Shafranov solver has been developed for the NIMROD code.
- Fields created for a constant lambda cylindrical pinch show good agreement with analytical solution.
- Nonlinear simulations of equilibria ran over numerous Alfvén times suggest that the plasma is in equilibrium.
- Addition benchmarking is being performed.
- Functionality to create grid and generate initial magnetic field along the boundary will be created within NIMEQ.
- Use equilibria from NIMEQ to study SSPX and other configurations.